

University of Groningen

Recensie: Een democratie in gevaar: een verslag van de situatie op Curaçao tot 1987

Romer, R. A.

Published in:

Bijdragen tot de taal- land- en volkenkunde

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:

1991

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Romer, R. A. (1991). Recensie: Een democratie in gevaar: een verslag van de situatie op Curaçao tot 1987. *Bijdragen tot de taal- land- en volkenkunde*, 147(2-3), 369-369.

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.



Book Reviews

- Walter E.A. van Beek, Ph. Quarles van Ufford, Religion and development; Towards an integrated approach, Amsterdam: Free University Press, 1988., M. Schoffeleers (eds.)
- J.H. de Beer, H.F. Tillema, A journey among the people of Central Borneo in word and picture, edited and with an introduction by Victor T. King, Singapore: Oxford University Press, 1989. 268 pp.
- Chris de Beet, Richard Price, Alabis world. Baltimore and London: The John Hopkins University Press, 1990. xx + 444 pp.
- G. Bos, Neil L. Whitehead, Lords of the tiger spirit; A history of the Caribs in colonial Venezuela and Guyana 1498-1820, Koninklijk Instituut voor Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde, Leiden. Caribbean series 10, Dordrecht/Providence: Foris publications, 1988, 250 pp., maps, ill., index, bibl.
- James R. Brandon, Richard Schechner, By means of performance: Intercultural studies of theatre and ritual. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1990. 190 + xv pp + ill. Paperback, Willa Appel (eds.)
- J.N. Breetvelt, Matti Kamppinen, Cognitive systems and cultural models of illness, Helsinki: Academia Scientiarum Fennica, FF Communications No. 244, 1989. 152 pp.
- Martin van Bruinessen, Mark R. Woodward, Islam in Java: Normative piety and mysticism in the Sultanate of Yogyakarta. Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 1989, 311 pp, index.
- J.G. de Casparis, Pauline Lunsingh Scheurleer, Ancient Indonesian Bronzes; A catalogue of the exhibition in the Rijksmuseum Amsterdam with a general introduction. Leiden: Brill, 1988. IX + 179 pp., richly illustrated., Marijke J. Klokke (eds.)
- Hugo Fernandes Mendes, Luc Alofs, Ken ta Arubiano? Sociale intergartie en natievorming op Aruba, Leiden: Caraïbische Afdeling, Koninklijk Instituut voor Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde, 1990. ix + 232 pp., Leontine Merckies (eds.)
- Rene van der Haar, I. Eibl-Eibesfeldt, Kommunikation bei den Eipo; Eine humanethologische bestandsaufnahme, Berlin: Dietrich Reimer Verlag, 1989., W. Schiefenhövel, V. Heeschen (eds.)
- M. Heins, K. Epskamp, Populaire cultuur op de planken; Theater, communicatie en Derde Wereld. Den Haag: CSEO Paperback no. 6, 1989., R. van t Rood (eds.)
- Huub de Jonge, Thomas Höllman, Tabak in Südostasien; Ein ethnographisch-historischer Überblick, Berlin: Dietrich Reimer Verlag, 1988. Bibl., tab., ill., append., 233 pp.,
- Nico de Jonge, Jowa Imre Kis-Jovak, Banua Toraja; Changing patterns in architecture and symbolism among the Sadan Toraja, Sulawesi - Indonesia. Amsterdam: Royal Tropical Institute, 1988, 135 pp., Hetty Nooy-Palm, Reimar Schefold (eds.)
- L. Laeyendecker, Jeffrey C. Alexander, Durkheimian sociology: Cultural analysis, Cambridge etc.: Cambridge University Press, 1988, 227 pp.

- Thomas Lindblad, W.A.I.M. Segers, Changing economy in Indonesia. A selection of statistical source material from the early 19th century up to 1940. Vol 8. Manufacturing industry 1870-1942. Amsterdam, 1987. 224 pp.
 - C.L.J. van der Meer, Akira Suehiro, Capital accumulation in Thailand 1855-1985, The Centre for East Asian Cultural Studies, Tokyo, 1989. xviii + 427 pp., maps, figs, app.
 - Niels Mulder, Nancy Eberhardt, Gender, power, and the construction of the moral order: Studies from the Thai periphery, University of Wisconsin-Madison, Centre for Southeast Asian Studies, Monograph 4, 1988. viii + 100 pages, softcover.
 - Gert Oostindie, Jan Nederveen Pieterse, Wit over zwart; Beelden van Afrika en zwarten in de Westerse populaire cultuur. Amsterdam: Koninklijk Instituut voor de Tropen, 1990. 259 pp., ills.
 - Gert Oostindie, Raymond Corbey, Wildheid en beschaving; De Europese verbeelding van Afrika. Baarn: Ambo, 1989. 182 pp., ills.
 - R. Ploeg, Inga Clendinnen, Ambivalent conquests; Maya and Spaniard in Yucatan, 1517-1570, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988. xi + 243 pp.
 - S.O. Robson, Luigi Santa Maria, Papers from the III European Colloquium on Malay and Indonesian Studies. Istituto Universitario Orientale, Dipartimento di Studi Asiatici (Series Minor XXX). Naples 1988. 276 pp., Faizah Soenoto Rivai, Antonio Sorrentino (eds.)
 - R.A. Römer, J.M.R. Schrijs, Een democratie in gevaar; Een verslag van de situatie op Curaçao tot 1987. Van Gorcum, Assen: 1990. xii + 292 blz.
 - Patricia D. Rueb, Han ten Brummelhuis, Merchant, courtier and diplomat: A history of the contacts between the Netherlands and Thailand, Lochem, 1987, 116 pp., illustrated.
- In: Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde 147 (1991), no: 2/3, Leiden, 339-371

BOEKBESPREKINGEN

Ph. Quarles van Ufford and M. Schoffeleers (eds), *Religion and development; Towards an integrated approach*, Amsterdam: Free University Press, 1988.

WALTER E.A. VAN BEEK,
University of Utrecht

The present volume is the outcome and, in a way, the profession of faith of the research programme of the department (vakgroep) of Cultural Anthropology of the Vrije Universiteit in Amsterdam. The attempt to unite the paradigm of *meaning* with those of *power* and *development* poses a risky challenge, but a stimulating one as well, judging from the present collection, which appeared on the occasion of the retirement of Professor Schoorl in 1988.

In their introduction, the editors outline the histories of the two sub-disciplines of the anthropology of religion and of development. In some ways, these two ran a parallel course, having similar life cycles. Both started by addressing problems of order within socio-political structures considered as given or uniquely relevant. Then, in the second phase, they challenged that order with an array of alternative concepts and theories. The latter phase seems to be one of de-ideologization: a retreat within the familiar sphere (religion, mythology on the one hand, and 'purely practical' studies on the other), denying, if not the validity, then surely the productivity of change-engineering theories.

The last chapter of the volume, Van Wesemael-Smit's contribution on Autonomy and Women's groups, delineates a similar historical path for women's studies. Starting from protests against unequal opportunities, firmly embedded in an integration strategy, these studies moved on to the 'alternative order' of women's autonomy, recently to become de-politized in the move towards the less daunting task of 'improvement of women's conditions'. The contributions of Van Kessel and Droogers show the same change of discourse: the three secularizing models of modernization they mention (pp. 55, 56) closely coincide with the one outlined in the introduction. What seems to be absent in both the latter fields, however, is a genuine paradigmatic discussion. Couched in terms of strategic gender interest, Van Wesemael-Smit obliquely raises the problem of the relative lack of a gender theory (p. 276), while the absence of a more general theory of social transformation can be inferred from the section on Latin America.

The chapter on women's studies differs from the other contributions in that it treats a theoretical discussion without reference to any specific body of empirical data. Still, women's studies not only has a place in anthropological theory, but also constitutes an arena of concepts with respect to development. It could, then, have benefited from the approach indicated in the introduction, analysing development discussions as a religious discourse. This interesting approach now remains at a programmatic level; it is a reflection on development discussions rather than being realized in the various contributions.

Power, perhaps more than development, seems to form a major link between the contributions. In the introduction the editors stress the power struggle between state and religion, citing Bourdieu's work as well as the notion of 'religious regimes' in their search for a unifying theory. In a way, the theoretical discussion about power seems to be more sophisticated and more fundamental than that about development as such. Most contributions address the problem of power as one of the central issues in their data analysis, especially the legitimation and ideological foundation of power systems.

The individual contributions are interesting, well researched and well written. Tennekes traces the discourse of modernization in the Dutch Protestant churches. Disputing Asad's insistence on power as a prime mover of religion, Tennekes argues that religious processes have an endogenous logic not reducible to the logic of power, and that religious discourse is an autonomous power factor. In a way, this goes against the grain of the book, and at least of the introduction, as the relative autonomy of ecclesiastical discourse – though interesting enough – is not the subject of this book. Still, it is an interesting illustration of how a transcendental faith is 'reconverted' into social action, or at least into a social discourse, with a focus – nicely Protestant – on the power of 'the Word'.

The first half dozen articles address the core issue of the volume. Van Kessel and Droogers show a glimpse of the struggle between church and state in the field of development in Latin America (mainly Brazil), where the secular powers tried to redefine developmental issues in terms of disappearing folk-ways, class struggle or pragmatic goals, while the church (would the term religious regime be appropriate here?) redefines secular history in liberationist theological terms. A comparable conflict is documented by Koster for Malta. Islam has its power struggles as well; for Tunisia Venema shows how mullahs and fraternities were thwarted in their struggle for political control by an increasing secularization of development, while Sutherland argues that the spread of Islam in Indonesia has been marked by a stand-off between sultans and trader networks within the confines of Islam.

The other side of the coin, the development organization itself, is highlighted by two articles in particular. Quarles van Ufford describes the see-saw movement between the Dutch and the Javanese Protestant churches in defining priorities of development and aid. His conclusion that the combination of fund-providing with little contextual knowledge is stronger than the contextualized fund recipient is not very surprising, but does raise some questions on the power of discourse. Van der Linden and Selier address the problem of government legitimation in a lucid analysis of planning in Pakistan. Plans here are made to project an image and proclaim a message about the government, but not for implementation.

The other articles are less pertinent to the central themes, as they describe local reactions to major interventions or transformations – an interesting theme, but tangential to the mainstream of ideas in the volume. The advantages of religious flexibility for the untouchables in South India (Kooiman), the two opposite theological ways of reacting to apartheid (Schoffeleers), the revolt of the Diola in the Basse Casamance, and the

redefinition of ethnicity by urban Batak and Toraja (Schefold) as well as by Creoles in Amsterdam (Van Wetering) are fascinating cases of redefinition of self and context by more or less marginalized peoples, worthy in fact of a more elaborate separate treatment.

Summing up, this is a volume of interesting contributions that are testimony of a viable and productive research programme, and which are linked together by an ingenious and thought-provoking introduction.

H.F. Tillema, *A Journey Among the People of Central Borneo in Word and Picture*, edited and with an introduction by Victor T. King, Singapore: Oxford University Press, 1989. 268 pp.

J.H. DE BEER

The volume under review is the English annotated edition of *Apo-Kajan: Een filmreis naar Centraal Borneo*, first published in 1938. The book tells the story of the Dutch pharmacist and traveller Hendrick Tillema on his expedition to the remote Apo Kayan region of Borneo in the early 1930s.

The book is divided into two sections. In the first, which is liberally illustrated with photographs, Tillema describes his elaborate preparations for the Apo Kayan expedition and tells the lively tale of his boat journey along the Kayan River. The second section, consisting exclusively of photographs with captions, is mainly ethnographical, illustrating principally the material culture and technology of the Kenyah, with some additional material on the Punan hunters and gatherers. While the original Dutch edition is illustrated with 336 black and white pictures, the English edition contains a selection of 255 high-quality illustrations.

As Tillema explicitly indicates, he did not wish to paint a sensational picture of the natives of Borneo, but tried to portray them as realistically as possible. In spite of all the technological drawbacks of the time — he had to pose all his subjects, for example — Tillema succeeded in making portraits full of character of both Kenyah and Punan people.

On his expedition, Tillema also made a film. A copy of this film was rediscovered in the collection of the Royal Institute of the Tropics in 1988. It had been stored in a villa near Bloemendaal, the village where Tillema lived after his return to the Netherlands.

It was Tillema's ambition to have his material published in English, and he started on the English translation of parts of the book himself. Now, almost sixty years later, Victor King has finished the project, adding an excellent introduction. The result is a book that is a must for all who are interested in the visual aspects of the cultures of Borneo.

Richard Price, *Alabi's world*. Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1990. xx + 444 pp. ISBN 080 18 3862 2 and 080 18 3956 4.

CHRIS DE BEET

Universiteit van Amsterdam

Alabi's world is Richard Price's latest work on the history of the Saramaka Maroons of Suriname. Richard Price started his fieldwork among the Saramaka in the mid-1960s. Together with his wife Sally, he has published several works covering a wide range of topics, including wood carving, the social structure, calabash art, and folk tales. During their first period of fieldwork, they were explicitly forbidden by their Saramaka hosts to ask questions about First-Time (*fési-tén*). Knowledge of First-Time – i.e., of the history of the Saramaka Old-Time people – was considered dangerous because of its function as a 'charter', not only for the ownership of the important ritual possessions of the clan but also for entitlements to land. It is especially important for understanding interclan politics and must be kept hidden from outsiders.

After his first visit to the Saramaka region, Price became an expert on Saramaka history by exploring the rich archival sources of the Algemeen Rijksarchief in The Hague. Meanwhile, the Saramakas' social and economic life and their attitude to the First-Time changed significantly. Some Saramaka elders conceived the idea that First-Time knowledge should be noted down before it was lost forever. In 1979 Price was asked by members of the Matjau clan to write a book on their history. The first volume, based on an exchange of historical knowledge between Price and the Saramaka historians, was *First-Time: the historical vision of an Afro-American people* (1983). The present volume begins where *First-Time* leaves off. It gives a description of the period between the signing of the peace treaty in 1762 and the death of Granman Alabi in 1820. The experiment in ethnographic-historical writing, whereby fragments of oral testimonies are presented and interpreted with the aid of various sources of information, is further developed. In *Alabi's world* a new party, the German Moravian missionaries, enters the scene. They settled in Saramaka territory to convert the heathens shortly after the peace treaty. Their doctrine and their activities are described in a separate chapter, which reads like a short ethnography. Together with the Dutch colonial administrators, the Saramaka, and Price as the mediating historian, they constitute the four voices of the book. Each of these voices is marked by its own style. More than in Price's earlier work, fragments are connected by what is called 'educated imagination'. It is this element of fiction which will amaze the more positivistic reader who prefers to maintain the distinction between historiography and fiction. In general, the interpretations seem very plausible, as they are based on detailed investigations and a profound insight into the life of 18th-century Saramaka. In a few cases the pretension to exactness may irritate the reader, as, for instance, where two important Saramaka forefathers are portrayed as Twi-speakers, with only a vague indication that they originate from the Akan area.

Alabi's world is an arena in which different worlds interact on the basis of very incomplete mutual understanding. Price has the gift of being able to provide the reader with an insight into the complex relations between the Saramaka, Dutch administrators, and Moravian missionaries. The illustrations in the book are carefully chosen and provide the reader with a basis for his conception of 18th-century Saramaka. The alternation between narrative, description and supplementary analysis, in combi-

nation with 150 pages of notes and commentary, makes reading this book a complex, fascinating, and rewarding exercise. *Alabi's world* is an excellent example of the fruitfulness of the ethno-historical approach to Afro-American societies.

Neil L. Whitehead, *Lords of the Tiger Spirit; A history of the Caribs in colonial Venezuela and Guyana 1498-1820*, Koninklijk Instituut voor Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde, Leiden. Caribbean Series 10, Dordrecht/Providence: Foris Publications, 1988, 250 pp., maps, ill., index, bibl. ISBN 9067652407.

G. BOS

This is a very detailed and thorough study, which refers to some 50 original documents in Sevilla, about 30 in The Hague, and numerous papers in London archives. In addition to these primary sources, Whitehead has used around 200 published works, of which a good many are in Spanish and a number in Dutch and French. The nine chapters into which the book is divided are headed as follows: I. The European encounter; II. Carib demography, 1500-1700; III. Carib society; IV. The Carib frontier; V. The conquest of Caribana, 1700-1771; VI. The Spanish missions; VII. The Dutch connection; VIII. Cannibalism and slavery; IX. Conclusion.

The Guyana mentioned in the subtitle refers only to former British Guyana - the territory of the old Dutch enclaves on the Essequibo, Demarara and Berbice Rivers. Since most of Venezuelan Carib history is inaccessible to non-Spanish-reading students, it is important that this study is in English.

The author has given a clear picture of the policies introduced by the Spanish and Dutch colonial powers. The Spanish military and the Roman Catholic missionaries were more or less in armed conflict with the Carib tribes for over 200 years. But the Dutch on the Essequibo had had a lasting alliance with the tribes on the coast and in the interior since the early 1670s. In Surinam as well, the Dutch had made peace with the Caribs, with whom they had been at war since they had taken over the colony from the English in 1667, as early as 1686. Another major difference between Venezuela on the one hand and Guyana and Surinam on the other hand was provided by the missionary activities. Missions by Spanish priests both on the Orinoco and in the areas north, east and west of it started in the mid-17th century. The author mentions some 50 missionary posts in his index - a testimony to the large scale of missionary activity in the area. By contrast, one mission station was established in Dutch Guyana in the 1730s, on Wironje Creek, in the lower Berbice region, and another in the 1760s, on the lower Saramacca. In the late 1760s another one was added, on the right bank of the lower Corantijn. All three of these mission posts were run by the Moravian Brethren. This explains why Dutch influence on American society was much weaker than that of the Spanish, although it was not negligible. The Dutch were more interested in trading with the

tribes of the interior than in the conquest of the latter's territory. Dutch merchandise penetrated as far south as the lower Rio Negro, while Indian products were shipped to Holland from the early 17th century onward. Later on, Dutch interest extended to plantations on the lower reaches of the Demarara, Essequibo, and Berbice Rivers, as well as in Surinam. Conversely, the establishment of many Spanish forts deep in the interior, combined with many mission posts, had an enormous impact on Carib society and Amerindian population levels in the areas dominated by the Spanish. Especially the comparison between the Spanish and Dutch policies and their effects makes Whitehead's analyses highly valuable for those interested in Amerindian history in Venezuela and Guyana. This study also provides a good background for comparative studies of the policies pursued in Surinam and Cayenne on the one hand and those adopted by the Portuguese in areas north of the Amazon on the other.

The following minor criticisms do not in any way detract from my appreciation of Whitehead's work. Firstly, it is regrettable that, while some 50 missions posts are mentioned in the text, only 30 are indicated on Map IV, because '... those of less than one year's duration [are] not shown'. Secondly, of the five maps in the book, the first one, 'Principal trade routes of the Caribs', gives the names of rivers in such small print that they are hardly legible without a magnifying glass. The same applies to Map IV. On Map II, 'The lower Orinoco, reproduced from Schomburgk's map of 1848 to illustrate Sir Walter Raleigh's voyage', the names of rivers and almost all the other toponyms are also much too small. Although modern printing and binding techniques make unfolding maps less practical, the publisher could still have reproduced the maps in parts, with larger type to increase their legibility.

Richard Schechner and Willa Appel (eds), *By means of performance: Intercultural studies of theatre and ritual*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1990. 190 + xv pp + ill. Paperback

JAMES R. BRANDON,
University of Hawaii at Manoa

This collection of conference papers is important for its overall topic but is uneven in its contents. It contains sixteen of the approximately fifty papers presented at a trio of conferences devoted to ritual and theatre (one in Arizona and two in New York City), organized by Richard Schechner and Victor Turner in 1981 and 1982. The goal of the multi-conference was a search for 'universals of performance' through examination of 'six areas of interest': transformation of being, intensity of performance, audience-performer transactions, transmission of performance knowledge, and performance evaluation (3-6). Some of the difficulty in getting seventy-four participants (artists showed their work as well) to work within these conceptual frames is reflected in the fact that the essays are not divided into these areas, nor are they discussed in these terms in the Introduction. The reader must relate each essay to the organizers' larger themes, if s/he can.

Turner and Schechner directly address the question 'are there universals in performance' in their essays at the beginning of the volume, and Herbert Blau returns to it at the close. Turner defends the universality of his well-known theory of liminality in social drama against published criticisms, especially by Clifford Geertz (Geertz was not at the conference). Schechner identifies universals of performance through a seven-tier division of 'magnitudes of performance' that range from microbits to macrodrama (44). He draws on the *Natyasastra* and on Western psychological theories of emotional expression whose origins go back to the 1930s and 40s to argue that by adopting muscular patterns of emotion we actually begin to feel that emotion (29-31). In a dense essay, Blau sails through Freud, Foucault, Derrida, and Artaud on the way to making the (unremarkable) pronouncement that '*what is universal in performance is the consciousness of performance*' (258-9) [Blau's italics]. He concludes that when 'everything seems open and available to us now', we must ask 'what the appropriation of any performance technique from an alien culture will mean' (271). This is a prescient question that I for one wish he had addressed.

Crucial issues are raised by Colin Turnbull in an impassioned, persuasive, and highly personal account of the anthropologist-as-participant in Africa. He argues that the liminality of Van Gennep and Turner is too simplified, and that in their concept of ritual change as 'transition' they inappropriately apply Western linear time to a non-Western culture. Among the Mbuti of Africa ritual change is better conceived of as being 'transformation' (80). The imposition of Western views on Arizona Indian deer dance rituals is the theme, not always overt, of a conversation among Yaqui Indians Anselmo and Heather Valencia and their white friend Rosamond B. Spicer. Heather politely agrees that white anthropologists' writings about the Yaqui are useful, for they helped the 'Yaquis secure their position and their land' (103), but such books aren't needed by the Yaquis themselves, who already know who they are. Anselmo: '[...] however sincere non-Yaquis are, they have their own way of explaining a thing that is not exactly the way I would explain it' (101). Paul Bouissac is brilliant in arguing that the circus clown represents a ritual profanation of the sacred. Miles Richardson sees the spatial arrangements of Catholic and Protestant churches as being highly expressive of the religions' different relationship between worshippers and god, the former formal and ritual, the latter personal and participatory (226-8).

Eight of the essays are field reports and analyses of specific rituals. Ranjini Obeyesekere's interpretation of three Sri Lankan rituals, Barbara Kirshenblatt-Gimblett on Purim celebrations in Brooklyn, Du-Hyun Lee's analysis of Korean shamanic performance, and James L. Peacock's account of primitive Baptist performance in the American south is each valuable in its own way.

In papers on Asian actor training, Monica Bethe and Karen Brazell (Japanese *noh*) and Philip Zarrilli (Indian *kalarippayattu*) develop in different ways the central theme that traditional non-Western performance is based on training through physical discipline. Such training 'does not rely in any way on intellectualization' (Bethe-Brazell, 174). Instead, once trained, the performer finds an energized life force 'will naturally course

through the body-as-vehicle' (Zarrilli, 137). Physicalization accounts for the power of Asian acting. It also provides the link between actor and the states of trance or possession so often found in ritual performance.

Three unsubstantial essays are also included. As a fortunate participant in the two New York conferences, I was present at fascinating presentations by Suzuki Tadashi on directing, Arata Isozaki on space in Japanese performance, JoAnne Akalaitis on creating new theatre pieces, William O. Beeman on the grossly neglected Arabic arts, James Boon on Balinese ritual theatre, and Farley Richmond on Indian ritual theatre, any of which would have done credit to this volume. Their absence is a distinct loss.

Matti Kamppinen, *Cognitive systems and cultural models of illness*, Helsinki: Academia Scientiarum Fennica, FF Communications No. 244, 1989. 152 pp.

J.N. BREETVELT

Kamppinen's dissertation consists of two different parts. Part A describes a selected history of cognitive anthropology and provides a general background and theoretical framework for the study of cultural models and ethomedicine. Part B studies models of illness in two Amazonian villages in Peru on the basis of interpretations derived from the theoretical framework of part A. For someone who is not conversant with the principles and issues of cognitive anthropology, part A makes no easy reading. Kamppinen constructs his theory in a very concise way, making use of examples taken from part B. The central notion is that the cognitive core of the health behaviour system is provided by the idea that the individual in an illness situation is a cognitive system confronting a set of therapeutical options; the illness situation is a problem situation for the individual, who aims at reducing the set of available therapeutical options to a single one, upon which to act; and the reduction of the possible courses of action is done by means of metaphorical models of illness that shape the client's perspective. The last chapter of part A describes the concepts of functional and ontological metaphors of illness, the container metaphor of the human body, and the role of mereonymic reasoning. These concepts play an important role in the second part of the book.

Part B gives a fascinating account of four months' fieldwork in two Amazonian villages inhabited by a Mestizo population. After a general description of the region, Kamppinen sets out to classify the various models of illnesses, such as illnesses of God (natural illnesses that can also be treated by Western medicine), fright (loss of spirit), and various forms of witchcraft (*mal de air*, *mal de agua*, *mal de monte* and *mal de gente*). Witchcraft has basically to do with envy, jealousy and vengeance. The fascinating thing about it is the use of metaphors for interpreting healing practices and the location of knowledge and evil. The code metaphor helps to understand the way in which healers and witches know how to decode the sources of illness and how to counteract and control the influence of the latter by using specific power songs. The correct power song summons

the relevant spirit, reveals its secret intention, and exposes the template that can control the actions of the spirit. The metaphor of open and closed boundaries is useful for visualizing how spirits enter the body – like projectiles – and how healing is the process of ‘sucking’ the evil from the body, instead of adding more projectiles, as Western medicine does through injections. The same metaphor of open and closed boundaries, seen in a social context, shows how the healer has to cross the boundaries of the community to acquire his/her knowledge, and as such might be a good instrument for studying the power structure of the healers vis-à-vis the community, the government and the churches.

All in all, Kamppinen has succeeded in demonstrating that his cognitive model of interpretation is a good instrument for combining the study of the target group’s own accounts giving information about its emic concepts, and the use of explanatory models. Of course, many problems have not been solved and many questions remain. For instance, what is happening in peri-urban situations with regard to both healers and clients; will health education change health behaviour, and if so in what way; what may be the influence of the many Protestant sects that have come to most of the Amazonian villages? Apparently there are more questions than answers – a fact that is acknowledged by Kamppinen where he states that many more years of research are needed to monitor behaviour and to study changes of concepts.

Mark R. Woodward, *Islam in Java: Normative Piety and Mysticism in the Sultanate of Yogyakarta*. Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 1989, 311 pp, index.

MARTIN VAN BRUINSEN

Javanese court religion has been the subject of several important philological studies, but to date there have been no significant anthropological studies of the actual beliefs and practices in *kraton*-oriented Javanese society. The present work (originally a Ph.D. thesis, Illinois, 1985) therefore promises to fill a major gap. The author did fieldwork in and around the Yogyakarta *kraton*, studying the major varieties of Islamic discourses and ritual: the *shari’a*-oriented version of the *kauman* (which he calls ‘normative piety’), the *kejawen* mysticism of the aristocracy, and the devotional religion of the lower classes. He moreover attempts to combine his ethnographic observations with an analysis of some relevant texts (*babad*, *hadith* and *Qur’an*) and a study of scholarly Orientalist literature on Indian and Middle Eastern Islam. This gives rise to expectations that the author, unfortunately, fails to fulfil.

In his presentation of the distinctive modes of belief and ritual in Central Java, Woodward offers us few independent observations but rather a collage of quotations from heterogeneous texts, originating from different times and places. His selection of these texts appears to be fortuitous (the only discernible criterion for their choice being their availability in English or Indonesian translations) and not always felicitous. He makes no serious

attempt to show how these texts are 'received', or how (or even whether) they are read, understood and used by his informants and how they contribute to the shaping of their overt beliefs and religious or social practice. In fact, the few times that he does claim that the older texts which are so extensively quoted by him are still widely read (such as, for instance, Kemas Fakhruddin's *Mukhtasar*, known from Drewes' edition), he appears to be mistaken (the widely read *Mukhtasar*, or 'Summary', is an entirely different text).

Our confidence in Woodward is further undermined by the numerous minor mistakes and errors with which his work is riddled, ranging from misspellings of Arabic and Javanese terms, and questionable explanations of their use and meaning, to misrepresentation of earlier scholarship, as well as his tendency to present personal opinions and interpretations (his own or his informants') as if they were established facts. The reasoning by which he attempts to relate contemporary Javanese thinking to classical Sufi ideas is often irritatingly sloppy. As an illustration, one example should suffice. 'Most Javanese', he asserts in the chapter on mysticism (p. 179), 'believe that [the] state of permanent union [with God] can be attained only after death and the destruction of the physical body [...]. For this reason both villagers and nobles refer to ancestors as *ing kang leluhur* (J.; the perfected ones). This view would appear to be related to the more general Sufi theory that the attainment of mystical union is a form of "social death" (Nicholson 1975:167) and the view of heretical mystics [...] that death is to be courted as a step leading to the attainment of the highest spiritual goals (Schimmel 1975:76).' I doubt whether my Javanese acquaintances would agree with Woodward's description of what 'most' of them believe, and his interpretation of *leluhur* is highly idiosyncratic, if not downright wrong (it is commonly translated as 'exalted'). The classical Sufi view is also misrepresented (Woodward refers to respected authorities, but quotes them out of context). The two ideas presented here are only made to look similar by Woodward's rephrasing of them. His use of the term 'related' suggests an influence but, as elsewhere, this influence is postulated rather than investigated.

Woodward's chief thesis is that *kejawen* is basically Islamic, not Hindu or Hindu-Buddhist, as reformist Muslims and, following them, Geertz, Peacock and other scholars have claimed. Taking as his point of departure Marshall Hodgson's comments that rituals like those described by Geertz may be encountered throughout the Muslim world (a point already made by Snouck Hurgronje), Woodward pushes this view to the extreme. Even the most obviously pre-Islamic elements of Javanese religion, such as the *wayang* and the concept of power, have in his view been thoroughly Islamicized. The victory of Islam was so complete in Java, says Woodward, because the court itself broke with Hinduism.

A central argument for this thesis is provided by an esoteric interpretation of the layout and architecture of the *kraton*, which makes up the sixth and most interesting chapter of the book. In this interpretation (presumably offered by local informants, for there are no textual references), the gates and passages along the north-south axis of the *kraton* reflect the Sufi doctrine of the Perfect Man, his descent from the Divine Essence to his

embodiment in the sultan, and his subsequent progress towards mystical (re)union. This reading, then, has the *kraton* firmly proclaim *Islamic* mystical doctrines. Characteristically, however, Woodward does not even stop to consider whether alternative interpretations exist, and is inclined to suppress everything that does not fit in with this reading. He appears to take it for granted, without any supporting evidence, that the builders of the *kraton* had this symbolism in mind, and thus made a deliberate break with the Indic cosmological symbolism of the earlier courts.

The book presents some quite interesting material. However, it is difficult to separate the wheat from the chaff, or the valuable idea from the questionable assertion and interpretation. It cannot therefore serve as a reliable introduction to the subject.

Pauline Lunsingh Scheurleer and Marijke J. Klokke, *Ancient Indonesian Bronzes; A Catalogue of the Exhibition in the Rijksmuseum Amsterdam with a General Introduction*. Leiden: Brill, 1988. IX + 179 pp., richly illustrated.

J.G. DE CASPARIS

Published simultaneously as an exhibition catalogue under the title *Divine Bronze: Ancient Indonesian Bronzes from 600 A.D. to 1600 A.D.* for exclusive distribution by the Rijksmuseum in Amsterdam, this catalogue offers much more than one would typically expect from such a publication. The introduction contains a scholarly study of the development of Indonesian bronze art and its historical and cultural background.

The bronze statues and statuettes are divided into seven groups on the basis of various criteria. Thus, the bronzes of the first two groups are those regarded as imports or close imitations of bronzes from South or Northeast India. Those of groups three and four are purely Javanese bronzes, the former Central Javanese in style, the latter representing a transitional phase leading to an East Javanese idiom. Group five includes a considerable number of statuettes of the 'Nganjuk *mandala*', dating from the last quarter of the tenth to perhaps the first half of the eleventh century. The remaining two groups comprise five statues found in Sumatra and three in Sulawesi. The remaining items, representing nearly half of the total of exhibited objects (114 in all), are one votive tablet, one mould for the production of clay tablets, one inscribed copper plate with a drawing, as well as sceptres, bells, a slit-drum, an incense burner, lamps, vessels, two 'zodiac beakers', bowls, trays, mirrors, etc.

If the chronology of the statues and statuettes proposed here is accepted, the implication is that no bronze statues were produced after the first quarter of the eleventh century. The Lokanātha of Gunung Tua (Tapanuli, Sumatera Utara), dated A.D. 1024, would be one of the last known, datable bronze images except for the curious bronze replica of the stone statues of Candi Jago in the form of a votive tablet, reproduced as no. 62 here. As yet, there is no satisfactory explanation for the absence of bronze statues after the first quarter of the eleventh century. The authors suggest

that the emphasis on the worship of ancestors, 'represented in the manifestation of a Hindu or Buddhist deity, taking the shape of the Main Image of a stone temple building' (p.39), may have discouraged the production of bronze images. This is a possibility, but there are others as well. One could also think, for instance, of the development of terracotta figurines as a factor discouraging the manufacture of bronze statues. Be that as it may, the absence of bronze images in the latter part of the 'Indo-Javanese' period (although the *wajras*, bells, zodiac beakers, etc., testify to the continuing skill of the Javanese bronze smiths) remains one of the many enigmas of the history of Indonesian art and architecture.

A related problem is that of the absence of (authentic) copper-plate inscriptions from between the mid-tenth and the mid-thirteenth centuries, whereas there are many such inscriptions dating from before and after this period. Only further research may one day provide a plausible solution for these problems. Although it cannot be expected that all the ideas put forward in the introduction will meet with agreement, it is without a doubt the most interesting and reliable survey of ancient Indonesian bronze sculpture that is available to date.

The identification of the bronze statues poses few problems at the present state of our knowledge. One problem is the curious but strikingly beautiful little bronze figure described under no. 28. It has often been regarded as a representation of Kāma, though incorrectly so, as the authors rightly argue. It is therefore classified here as an unidentified deity, as in the case of the flag-bearing deity of no. 52. There is also a problem with regard to two of the Nganjuk-style bronzes. If one compares nos. 51 and 53, one is struck by the similarity of the two representations. Yet, the former is described as the Wajrabodhisattwa Wajrasattwa, the latter as Ādi-Buddha Wajrasattwa. One of the arguments adduced for this curious distinction is the absence of a socle for no. 51. As other Bodhisattwas are, however, placed on socles (as, for instance, the Padmapāni of no. 48), this is not a strong argument. Only a new analysis of the Nganjuk *maṇḍala* as a whole may decide in favour of one or the other identification. Moreover, a comparison between this *maṇḍala* and that of the so-called Sambas treasure in the British Museum in London may yield some interesting results. The two authors of the catalogue under review would be best qualified to carry out such a project. Finally, there is occasionally the problem of distinguishing the representations of Śākyamuni in the Deer Park at Sarnath from those of the Jina Wairocana. It is true that the latter can often be identified by his *bodhyāgrīmuḍrā*, but this does not apply to the older representations of Wairocana, which feature the *dharmacakramuḍrā*, as do the Wairocanas of Borobudur. Thus, it is stated with reference to the Buddha illustrated as no. 24 that 'iconographically this same figure not only represents the first sermon of the historical Buddha, but also the cosmic Buddha of the centre: Wairocana'. As this statue features not only the *dharmacakramuḍrā* but also representations of the Wheel with two deer, there can be little doubt that the historical Buddha is intended.

A particular merit of the work under discussion is the attention it gives to the possibility of imports from the Indian subcontinent, Sri Lanka and mainland Southeast Asia, as well as Indonesian imitations or adaptations

of these (groups one and two). The conclusions, based on detailed analyses, shed light on the relations with different parts of the subcontinent (in particular Southeast Bangladesh, Nalanda, Amaravati, Buddhapad and Tamilnadu), as well as with parts of mainland Southeast Asia (in particular Dvāravatī in present Thailand).

One of the many interesting points emerging from this catalogue is the relative independence of bronze sculpture in comparison with stone sculpture. The precise relationship between these two kinds of iconography deserves a special study.

Despite a few other minor blemishes, such as the confusion between the Buddhas of Kota Bangun in Kalimantan and Kota Blater in East Java, and the identification of no. 67 as a 'hand-bell' (where would it be held? Certainly not by the part with the four Jinas!), this catalogue is a praise-worthy piece of work. Hopefully it marks the beginning of a new phase in the study of the history of ancient Indonesian art.

Luc Alofs en Leontine Merkies, *Ken ta Arubiano? Sociale integratie en natievorming op Aruba*, Leiden: Caraïbische Afdeling, Koninklijk Instituut voor Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde, 1990. ix + 232 pp. ISBN 90 6718 018 1.

HUGO FERNANDES MENDES

Wil de echte Arubaan ontstaan? Op deze wijze zou het boek van Alofs en Markies populair getypeerd kunnen worden. Gezien de tegenwoordig bepleite popularisering van de wetenschap zou dit wellicht een aardig alternatief voor de nu gekozen titel vormen, ware het niet dat hiermee het karakter van het boek geweld zou worden aangedaan. Het toegankelijker maken van de wetenschap heeft zo zijn grenzen.

De vraagstelling van het boek is: 'Wie mag zich heden ten dage zonder problemen en protesten Arubaan noemen?' Het boek is opgedeeld in drie delen en biedt een samenhangende en inzichtelijke beschrijving van de ontwikkeling die het eiland vanaf de vroegste tijden tot vandaag de dag heeft doorgemaakt. De economische ontwikkeling, met name gestimuleerd door de vestiging van een raffinaderij, is een belangrijke drijfveer geweest voor immigratie van relatief grote groepen, met name afkomstig uit de regio. De relaties tussen deze groepen vormen de rode draad van het boek, waarbij het proces van integratie en natievorming de centrale invalshoek vormt. De eerste acht hoofdstukken bevatten een toegespitste ordening van feiten die voor een belangrijk deel al elders zijn beschreven. In het laatste hoofdstuk, 'De politiek van het Arubaan zijn', wordt getracht een antwoord te formuleren op de gestelde vragen. Of de auteurs hierin zijn geslaagd is het onderwerp van deze bespreking, waarbij ook de vraagstelling als zodanig tegen het licht wordt gehouden.

De probleemstelling heeft een sociaal-psychologische inslag, waarbij aan het juridisch perspectief van het Arubaan-zijn geen aandacht is besteed. De vraag is welk nut het heeft om in een geïsoleerde context te

onderzoeken wie zich als 'echte' Arubaan mag presenteren. Valt er over de criteria ooit consensus te bereiken? De onderzoekers hebben over de diepere betekenis van hun onderzoeksvraag geen expliciete verantwoording afgelegd. Nu kan worden tegengeworpen dat het enkele feit dat er – zo mogelijk – inzicht ontstaat over wie zich Arubaan mag noemen en welke processen daarbij een rol spelen al winst is, namelijk verrijking van de kennis. Ik acht dit een steekhoudend argument, zij het met de kanttekening dat ik grote aarzelingen zou hebben als een dergelijk onderzoek in Nederland zou worden ingesteld: – wie mag zich heden ten dage zonder problemen en protesten Nederlander noemen?

De oorspronkelijke probleemstelling was qua opzet misschien wat ambitieus, maar veelbelovend. De onderzoekers wilden aanvankelijk nagaan of de jarenlange strijd van de Arubaanse bevolking voor een aparte status misschien werd verklaard door een eigen culturele identiteit. Kennelijk was deze doelstelling niet uitvoerbaar: de onderzoekers delen mee dat het realistischer was de bakens in eerder genoemde zin te verzetten.

Terug nu naar de vraag wie de 'echte' Arubaan is. Dat blijkt onder invloed van de 'Arubaans-Indiaanse renaissance' de autochtoon te zijn met een blanke huidskleur, sluikt haar en lichte ogen. Voorts is van belang het Papiamentu op Arubaanse wijze te spreken, op het platteland te wonen, dichtbij of op de *cunucu* van een van de voorouders. Verder dient men een oude Arubaanse achternaam te dragen, teneinde zich daarmee te kunnen beroepen op een lang Arubaans verleden (p.188). Het komt er dus op neer dat slechts een eeuwenoude historische worteling aanspraak geeft op het onvervalste Arubaan-zijn. Indien deze criteria ook naar Nederland getransponeerd zouden worden blijven er weinig 'echte' Nederlanders over.

Wat is nu het percentage 'echte' Arubanen? Van belang is het begrip autochtoon. De onderzoekers zijn streng in hun definitie, ongeveer 75% van de bevolking is op Aruba geboren, maar deze groep mag zich nog niet autochtoon noemen. Ook de 'tweede en derde generatie allochtone Arubanen' komen niet in aanmerking (p.174). De auteurs schatten dat rond 60% van de bevolking volgens deze criteria autochtoon is. Maar daarmee is men nog geen 'echte' Arubaan, want de karakteristieken zijn verder een blanke huidskleur, sluikt haar en lichte ogen... Het perspectief voor met name de Afro-Caribische immigranten om ooit Arubaan te worden en voor Aruba om het stadium van een *natiestaat* te bereiken is – hoewel ook een aantal integrerende ontwikkelingen worden beschreven – uitgaande van de resultaten van dit onderzoek somber.

In hoeverre is het beschreven beeld juist? Geven de auteurs niet een wat al te gechargeerd beeld van de werkelijkheid, is er wellicht sprake van een overmatige preoccupatie met de factor *ethniciteit*? Het antwoord op deze vragen valt niet te geven, omdat de wijze waarop de auteurs tot hun bevindingen zijn gekomen niet controleerbaar is. Volgens de onderzoekers waren ongeveer achthonderd Arubanen persoonlijk en actief betrokken bij het onderzoek, zijn er ongeveer honderd etnografische interviews gehouden, voorts vijfhonderd enquêtes onder scholieren tussen de 15 en 22 jaar oud en tenminste honderd schriftelijke en mondelinge enquêtes onder de bevolking van een wijk in San Nicolas (p.4). Maar onduidelijk is of en eventueel welke gestandaardiseerde vragenlijsten zijn gebruikt, en hoe de

te interviewen populaties zijn geselecteerd. Het boek bevat geen systematische verwerking van het ongetwijfeld imposante materiaal. Er is geen paragraaf, laat staan hoofdstuk, gewijd aan de resultaten van deze interviews, zodat geheel onbekend is tot welke significante correlaties een en ander aanleiding geeft. Wat ook wordt gemist is een definitie van het, voor de onderzoekers zeer centrale, begrip etnische groep. Zo vraag ik mij af of groepen immigranten die zich bij aankomst naar nationale herkomst organiseren in sport en sociale verenigingen zonder meer – zoals de schrijvers veelvuldig doen – als eenduidige 'etnische' groepen kunnen worden aangeduid. Zo'n groep, bijvoorbeeld de genoemde Surinaamse clubs, kan zijn samengesteld uit verschillende en overlappende etnische groepen. De organisatiefactor voor deze clubs was dan ook veelal niet de etniciteit, maar het land van herkomst.

Een boekbespreking heeft mede als functie de potentiële lezer te interesseren of juist de moeite van het lezen te besparen. De hiervoor gemaakte kanttekeningen zijn in dit geval bedoeld als een prikkeling tot lezing. De informatie die het boek bevat is waardevol, maar roept op tot tegenspraak.

I. Eibl-Eibesfeldt, W. Schiefenhövel, and V. Heeschen, 1989, *Kommunikation bei den Eipo; Eine humanethologische Bestandsaufnahme*, Berlin: Dietrich Reimer Verlag.

RENE VAN DER HAAR

The Eipo were only discovered quite recently – in 1974. Linguistically, they belong to the Mek group, located between the Yali and the Ok. Their habitat is a cool, hazy, rainy mountain region in the upper valleys of the Eipomek and Famek Rivers, at an altitude of about 4200 to 6900 feet. They are terrace-making gardeners with an almost neolithic technology. Their crops include sweet potatoes, taro, sugarcane, bananas and tobacco. In physical appearance and cultural outlook they strongly resemble the better-known mountain Papua of Irian Jaya and Papua New Guinea.

This book describes the results of a detailed study of the many elements of Eipo social life which bear and transmit meaning. Songs, colloquial expressions, sayings, facial expressions, gestures, clothing and decorations are among the elements the authors have recorded on tape or film. Emotions, intentions, identity components and elements of the cosmology are among the meanings they have traced.

An important point of reference in the monograph is formed by the idea that – in structuralist jargon – the basic *signifiants* and *signifiés* of social behaviour are roughly the same throughout the world. The authors explain this by stating that human social behaviour is constrained by biological pre-programming and by general rules of efficiency and intelligibility.

The scientific methods used to collect the data for this work might baffle classically trained students of non-Western societies. What to think, for instance, of the exposure of Eipo to a plastic spider for the sake of observing their reaction to the unknown? Moreover, on looking through the bibliography, one comes upon the names of Malinowski and Morris in the same column.

This *Bestandsaufnahme*, comprising 216 large-format pages, offers the reader a rich stock of material concerning Eipo signs and symbols (for which an index is lacking, however) and a great many fine film sequences, printed Muybridge-fashion, showing Eipo gestures and facial expressions. It further includes many ethologically biased statements about the relations between man's nature – taken literally – and his social behaviour.

K. Epskamp en R. van 't Rood (eds), *Populaire cultuur op de planken; Theater, communicatie en Derde Wereld*. Den Haag: CESO Paperback no. 6, 1989.

M. HEINS

De geschiedenis van de mensheid is ondenkbaar zonder theater. Een bijzondere vorm van theatrale expressie is het volkstheater, dat, zoals C.J. Hamelink in de inleiding uiteenzet, is ontstaan in een stedelijke omgeving, als een reactie op de gevestigde theatervormen van de elite. In de voorstellingen wordt ruimte gelaten voor het verbeelden van gebeurtenissen uit het dagelijks leven; maar in belangrijke mate is de populariteit van het volkstheater te danken aan de functie van commentator, soms kritisch of ironisch, soms behoudend of moralistisch, op het reilen en zeilen van de samenleving.

Ook in de voormalige gekoloniseerde gebieden in Azië, Afrika en Latijns-Amerika heeft het volkstheater zich ontwikkeld tot een populaire uiting van de (regionale) cultuur, waarover in deze publikatie een aantal case-studies worden gepresenteerd. Zo komen theatergroepen aan bod uit Ghana, beschreven door M. de Vos en H. van Herk, uit Zambia, door W. Haas en J. Ruijter, uit Zimbabwe, door M. IJssel de Schepper, uit de Philippijnen, door E. van Erven, uit Nicaragua, door R. Sprenger en uit Sri Lanka (Tamil Nadu), door H.M. de Bruin.

Het wordt o.m. duidelijk, dat de verschillende vormen van volkstheater zoals die in allerlei verschillende culturen en samenlevingen voorkomen enerzijds een sterke ideologische lading hebben, waarbij voorlichting wordt gegeven over allerlei zaken (leprabestrijding, geboortebepaling, jeugdprostitutie) aan de bevolking, die op andere manieren moeilijk te bereiken zou zijn. Hier komt een belangrijk opvoedend aspect bij kijken en het theater speelt zich af in de sfeer van het vormingstheater en de volwasseneneducatie. Anderzijds spelen artistieke en esthetische overwegingen een belangrijke rol bij de voorstellingen: de boodschap dient op een verantwoorde wijze vorm te krijgen. De groepen kunnen daarbij zowel uit traditionele theatervormen kiezen, zoals uit het voorbeeld van het *Terukkuttu* (Tamil Nadu) naar voren komt, als uit het avant-gardistische of experimentele theater.

Een speciale plaats bij deze ontwikkelingen wordt ingenomen door de niet-gouvernementele (hulp-)organisaties, die in sommige situaties theater gebruiken voor het geven van voorlichting en mede hebben bijgedragen in de ontwikkeling van het zogenaamde 'theatre for development'. Dit is

theater dat de doelgroep opzoekt, en binnen de volwasseneneducatie zowel wordt gebruikt als middel om de bevolking voor te lichten als te motiveren en enthousiast te maken om aan ontwikkelingsactiviteiten mee te werken (p.25-26). Zo blijken er ineens grote raakvlakken te bestaan tussen ontwikkelingssamenwerking en de ontwikkeling van het theater in de ontwikkelingslanden, waar bestaande theatervormen zich klaarblijkelijk goed lenen voor het overbrengen van ontwikkelingsbeleid.

Tenslotte vraag ik mij af, waarom er in deze zeer zeker inspirerende publikatie zo weinig beschrijvingen zijn van de voorstellingen zelf, alsof het de auteurs toch meer ging om de inhoud dan om de vorm: is dit niet juist één van de essentiële elementen van theater?

Thomas Höllmann, *Tabak in Südostasien; Ein ethnographisch-historischer Überblick*, Berlin: Dietrich Reimer Verlag, 1988. Bibl., tab., ill., append., 233 pp., ISBN 3-496-00981-0.

HUUB DE JONGE

This study, the trade edition of Höllmann's *Habilitationsschrift* (1986), deals with the history of tobacco in Southeast Asia. The author, noting the need for a summarizing overview of the spread of tobacco in this part of the world, tries to fill the gap with this book. In addition, using tobacco as a vehicle, he wants to give an insight into cultural change and what he calls 'forms of contact and influence' in the region. Both aims are only partly realized in this study – a fact that is already apparent from the organization and structure of the work.

The book opens with a survey of the use and cultivation of tobacco in Southeast Asia, which takes up half the text. Höllmann defines Southeast Asia rather broadly to include Taiwan, Southwest China, Assam, the Andaman Islands and the Nicobars. The development of tobacco-growing in each region is treated, on average, in one and a half pages, each preceded by a short if not always relevant review of the local political history. For reasons that are not quite obvious, the emphasis is on the 17th and 18th centuries. Only sporadically are events in later periods discussed, although it is commonly known that there was an enormous expansion in the cultivation of tobacco in several Southeast Asian countries in the 19th and 20th centuries. For example, only a few sentences refer to the inclusion of tobacco in the culture system (*Cultuurstelsel*) in Java or to the opening up of tobacco plantations in Sumatra. No further mention is made of these developments, nor of the impact of the cultivation of this crop on the native population.

In the next two chapters the cultivation, the processing, and the consumption of tobacco as a stimulant, a medicine or a poison is discussed. Using data from all over the region, a composite picture is drawn of the whole area. The regional differentiation that is typical of the first chapter

is lacking here. It is found only in the tables, which cover such subjects as the way in which tobacco leaves are fermented and dried, the materials of which pipes are made, and the diseases for which tobacco can be used as a medicine. The same approach is found in the final chapter, which deals with the role of tobacco in social relations and religious activities. Here, one learns what kinds of persons – men, women, children, princes, subjects, freemen or slaves – smoke; and on what kind of occasions; in what ceremonies and rituals tobacco is used and in which it is forbidden; and how tobacco, an imported cultigen, has become an autochthonous plant in local perceptions.

Throughout the book the author approaches the subject anecdotally and classificatorily. Interesting observations and statements from a great variety of written sources are placed in chronological and thematic order. The broad, summarizing arrangement of the study is such that the author is unable to answer the questions he raises. He neither succeeds in giving an overall comparison of the spread of tobacco in Southeast Asia, nor in analysing and interpreting his data on cultural and social change. A rigorous geographical and thematic demarcation would without doubt have resulted in a more profound study.

Despite these shortcomings, the book abounds with interesting data (for the collection of which alone the author deserves great praise), ideas, and points of departure for further research. The final chapter in particular contains much noteworthy information, among other things on the role of tobacco in relations with the outside world and in male-female relations; it seems that in many societies tobacco has sexual connotations. Höllmann's study moreover makes very good reading and is occasionally amusing. Perhaps the book can best be characterized as a reference book – a study that should not be read continuously but should be consulted regularly. The extensive bibliography also supports this characterization.

Jowa Imre Kis-Jovak, Hetty Nooy-Palm, Reimar Schefold, and Ursula Schulz-Dornburg, *Banua Toraja; Changing patterns in architecture and symbolism among the Sa'dan Toraja, Sulawesi – Indonesia*. Amsterdam: Royal Tropical Institute, 1988, 135 pp.

NICO DE JONGE

Few ethnic groups in Indonesia have retained an architecture of their own that is quite as alive as that of the Sa'dan Toraja of the highlands of South Sulawesi. Here they still build their magnificent houses and rice barns with their imposing curved roofs – hence the external influences which in so many Indonesian cultures initiated a saddening process of architectural uniformity hardly seem to have penetrated here. In fact, a recently published study by two anthropologists and two specialists in non-European

architecture shows that it is precisely the changes in Sa'dan Toraja society that have led to these spectacular buildings, among other things. As it turns out, the role of the Sa'dan Toraja house, and in particular of the so-called *tongkonan* – dwellings of representatives of a cognate descent group – has changed in the course of this century. And the inspired traditional architecture is closely connected with this.

First of all, the book gives an extensive description of the aspects that can be linked to the way in which a *tongkonan* (with one or more adjacent rice barns) used to function in the mountain world of yore. Traditionally the house not only shelters those who live in it but, as a symbolic centre of the descent group, also occupies an important position within the social organization. Besides, the building visualizes the relation between the living and their dead ancestors – a religious function that turns the house into a ritual centre. In addition, in its layout and orientation a traditional *tongkonan* reflects notions of the structure of the macrocosm. This is a more or less characteristic series of meanings of the house as may also be encountered in related Indonesian cultures. The great merit of the work discussed here is, however, that it does more than present these meanings; on the basis of the traditional functions described, it goes one step further.

It then turns out that a remarkable shift has occurred in the social functions of the *tongkonan* within Sa'dan Toraja society, through interaction with the outside world. In course of time, the emphasis came to lie on the *tongkonan* as a visible symbol of the descent group – to such an extent that the dwelling function suffered as a result of the concomitant developments in architecture. After the lucrative slave trade, the commerce in coffee – a crop the Sa'dan Toraja started growing at the end of last century – gave this process a new impulse. The coffee proceeds were used by these Toraja to enhance their prestige, in fulfilment of an ambition which, with wealth and birth as criteria, was deeply embedded in traditional Sa'dan Toraja society. The class and rank system which have survived to this day, as well as the performance of megalithic rituals, testify to this. The new wealth was made manifest in the increasingly exuberant design and decoration of newly built houses, as well as in the organization of grander funeral rituals, for the greater glory of the descent groups involved.

In the course of the 20th century, the advent of the mission and growing government influence have reinforced this mode of displaying status, that is, by means of an impressive *tongkonan*. For these two factors increasingly eliminated traditional opportunities for distinguishing oneself, for instance, through the exercise of physical strength in conflicts. In addition, recent developments in Sa'dan Toraja culture have given renewed stimulus to status-enhancing architecture. A large number of Sa'dan Toraja are now living beyond their native region, and have attained a certain prosperity in their new places of settlement. But many in the diaspora are left with feelings of insecurity, and wish to retain links with the relatives who have stayed behind. This penchant for ethnic security is manifested in, among other things, substantial financial contributions to the construction of new *tongkonan* of prestigious design. As a result, these buildings may now also be interpreted as symbols of ethnic identity.

The book's splendid visualization of the *tongkonan*'s architectural de-

velopment clearly shows how the increasingly dominant element of prestige has pushed the dwelling function into the background. Highly illustrative technical drawings and quantities of good photographs show that, though the basic design has remained unchanged, the vertical dimension is being increasingly emphasized. The piles supporting the floor have grown progressively taller, and the roof's curvature also is bolder now. Ironically, the price that has to be paid for this spectacular but impractical style of building is that it necessitates an additional house in which to live – a small, standard-type of Indonesian house as is often found beside a modern *tongkonan*. The living-space in the prestigious building itself is far too restricted to fulfil its dwelling function, and in many cases the top-heavy construction has become unstable, moreover. The contemporary *tongkonan* has developed into a house without a hearth, and contrary to what one might think at first sight, to live beside such a structure is therefore by no means simply a consequence of the modern Indonesian life-style.

The book is unique in its recording of the close relationship between the changed patterns in symbolism and in architecture among the Sa'dan Toraja. The cooperation between two anthropologists, an architect and a photographer specialized in vernacular architecture has resulted in a work that is more than the sum of the contributions of the various disciplines concerned. Even the final chapter, which contains a detailed survey of architectural forms among the Sa'dan Toraja that goes far beyond the *banua*, or dwelling-house and has a one-sided emphasis on design and technique, hardly detracts anything from this impression. Moreover, contrary to the impression one might get from a remark in the Introduction, the book is the outcome not merely of the two months' field work carried out by the team in 1983, but surely more especially of the insights of Hetty Nooy-Palm, gained from years of studying the Sa'dan Toraja. In the same way that current Sa'dan Toraja architecture literally towers above comparable forms of Indonesian house design, *Banua Toraja* stands head and shoulders above the few other studies in this field.

Jeffrey C. Alexander (ed.), *Durkheimian sociology: Cultural analysis*, Cambridge etc.: Cambridge University Press, 1988, 227 pp.

L. LAEYENDECKER

This volume 'was conceived amidst the effervescence of a small and lively conference on 'Emile Durkheim's sociology of religion' in 1983'. It is surprising, therefore, that only two of the participants have contributed to the book, the ambitions of the editor of which clearly go beyond Durkheim's sociology of religion.

Hunt, Tiryakian and Rothenbuhler analyse revolutions and strikes from the perspective of 'the sacred'. Wallace and Hartley explore religious elements in friendship. Collins discusses the Durkheimian tradition in

conflict sociology. Müller gives an excellent overview of theories on the legitimization crisis. Dayan and Katz investigate the articulation of consensus by the ritual and rhetoric of media events. The last contribution, by Alexander, discusses cultural and political crises on the basis of the Water-gate scandal.

The collection is intended as a substantial contribution to cultural sociology in the tradition of Durkheim. This intention is only partly fulfilled. The editor, who shows himself to be rather self-confident in his introduction, does not shrink from sweeping statements. In his words, the heritage of Durkheim 'has yet fully to be claimed'. Sociologists are only acquainted with Durkheim's earlier work, and his interest in culture as manifest in *Les formes élémentaires de la vie religieuse* has been discovered too late. Moreover, 'in sociology there is as yet scarcely any cultural analysis at all'. Therefore, a reorientation on Durkheim, 'for sociology, the most classic [author] of all', may bring a solution nearer.

I do not wish to say anything to detract from Durkheim's importance for sociology in general and cultural sociology in particular. On the contrary. Nevertheless, some critical comments are in place.

Firstly, Alexander's statement that there is 'scarcely any cultural analysis at all' is strongly exaggerated. Apparently the work of Norbert Elias and his followers, for example, have escaped Alexander's attention. Although he acknowledges the importance of the work in the Weberian tradition, he gives no attention to cultural sociology in present-day Germany or France (Bourdieu).

Secondly, the relation between the contributions to this volume and Durkheim's work is not always as visible as the title suggests it might be. Rothenbuhler, for example, enters into a discussion with Victor Turner, who, according to him, belongs to that group of scholars 'who feel little need for explicit citation' of Durkheim's work, 'just as Geertz, Shils and Mary Douglas'. Even so, the 'legacy of Durkheim is so powerful that it manifests itself in the style and logic' of these scholars. This statement of Rothenbuhler's is surprising, seeing that Durkheim is frequently cited in the works of Douglas (e.g., *Natural symbols*, *Purity and danger*, and *Implicit meanings*), in Geertz's *The interpretation of cultures*, and in Turner's *Dramas, Fields and Metaphors*. Rothenbuhler wants to pull Turner back 'more explicitly into the Durkheimian tradition', however. Having said that, Rothenbuhler mentions Durkheim no more, because 'my dialogue with Durkheim, then, is through Turner'.

A third example is Collins' paper on Durkheim's contribution to conflict sociology. It seems to consist of an analysis of the mechanisms for the internal integration of a group. Of course, internal integration is an important power resource in conflict relations. But to label this as an important contribution to conflict sociology by Durkheim is rather far-fetched.

These comments are not meant to detract from the value of the contributions themselves, most of which are very readable and interesting. As such, it is a useful book. Only, the message is rather irritating.

W.A.I.M. Segers, *Changing Economy in Indonesia. A Selection of Statistical Source Material from the Early 19th Century up to 1940. Vol. 8. Manufacturing Industry 1870-1942*. Amsterdam, 1987. 224 pp.

THOMAS LINDBLAD

The statistical series 'Changing Economy in Indonesia' is gradually becoming a major point of departure for researchers focusing on the economic history of the former Netherlands Indies, especially those working outside the Netherlands, far from the rich archival sources at Leiden and The Hague. The latest contribution, a volume on the manufacturing industry, only enhances the importance of this series of source publications. This volume was compiled by William Segers under the supervision of Peter Boomgaard, then of the Free University of Amsterdam – a worthy successor of the late P. Creutzberg, who initiated the series.

This volume is important, as it concerns an area that is too often neglected by historians of the colonial economy in Indonesia. It represents a major achievement for two reasons: its wide coverage in terms of both variables and indicators, and its bold attempts to solve the seemingly unsolvable methodological and technical problems of giving a quantitative impression of manufacturing in colonial Indonesia. Segers is not afraid to speculate when necessary. However, his tables are likely to provoke questions rather than provide answers, and there is much that will invite criticism, or at least scepticism. In short, the book is not the last word in a historical debate, but rather marks the beginning of a new discussion.

The conceptual difficulties begin on the very first page, where we are confronted with the question of what exactly do we mean by 'manufacturing industry'? The definitions may be inferred from current usage in an industrial economy, or alternatively, may be geared to the specific circumstances prevailing in a less developed context. Segers appears to choose both possibilities at the same time. His demarcation lines run straight across existing sectors. So sugar factories are included, while cane-cutting is not. Petroleum refineries are treated separately from derricks and pipelines. Tin is included, but not coal. The selection of industries is not free from a certain arbitrariness. However, I presume that the author would welcome suggestions for alternatives.

Another problem has to do with the selection of indicators of industrial development, which is all the more important as it touches on the question of the extent to which the indigenous populations benefited from the hesitant attempts at industrialization towards the close of the colonial era. Segers refrains from stressing certain indicators at the expense of others. He offers a broad spectrum of heterogeneous impressions, ranging from scattered and often incomplete time series on numbers of factories and employees, through export volumes, to spot data for specific benchmark years (for instance, the censuses of 1905 and 1930, and industrial surveys carried out in 1915, 1919 and 1940/41). It is left up to the reader to corroborate the evidence from the various sources.

Segers comes up with some startling observations. He demonstrates convincingly that the famed drive for industrialization at the time of the

First World War in fact did not amount to very much. His assessment of the impact of the Depression on manufacturing in the colony, however, is far less clear-cut. As he undoubtedly realizes himself, little can be inferred from the 1930 census data, as the effects of the Depression only became noticeable relatively late in comparison with the Western world. Segers even so claims that certain effects can be identified on the regional level, including an alleged 'fractional' increase in numbers of factory workers outside Java during the years 1931-1934. This is difficult to reconcile with the available literature on individual regions. Also, he asserts that less than four per cent of the non-European population, indigenous or Chinese, was employed in industry at the turn of the century. He appears not to realize, however, that the definition of 'workers' in the 1905 census precludes such a conclusion.

A previous volume (number 5, 1979) in the Changing Economy series contained a reprint of J.J. Polak's calculations of the Indonesian national income during the inter-war period. Segers disagrees with the figures given by Polak for the total wage bill in manufacturing, aside from Polak's erroneous distribution of factory wages over the different population categories — which is easily corrected. He therefore presents an alternative calculation, based on some rather bold assumptions. For one thing, he assumes a fixed ratio between available wage figures and production, thus by definition ruling out changes in productivity levels. For another, he assumes a constant share of his sample in the general total, which may or may not be the case.

On balance, however, Segers' volume represents a highly interesting scholarly work in the field of quantitative economic history. It demonstrates a thorough knowledge also of the details of production of individual goods, including the conversion of various refined oils into homogeneous volume measurements, and the rise of smoke-houses in indigenous rubber production at the time of the international restrictions in the 1930s.

In conclusion, two minor observations may be added. Exports of crude oil prior to 1917 could have been included in the tables under another heading. Finally — though this may only be relevant for those interested in the region in question — Tanjungseilor is not located on the island of Tarakan, but across the water in mainland Kalimantan (p.146).

Akira Suehiro, *Capital Accumulation in Thailand 1855-1985*,
The Centre for East Asian Cultural Studies, Tokyo, 1989. xviii
+ 427 pp., maps, figs, app.

C.L.J. VAN DER MEER

This book contains the results of about a decade of research on the development of capitalist enterprises in Thailand since 1855. It is by far the most extensive source of its kind for Thai enterprises, providing much information that was previously either unavailable or difficult of access.

To begin with, it should be pointed out that the title of the book is somewhat misleading. One would expect aggregate statistics on capital

formation, and information on its sources (domestic and foreign) and on historical trends. Instead, the book focuses on the development of enterprises in four sub-periods of Thai economic history. These are: (1) the period of the rise of capitalist groups, from the time of the Bowring Treaty to the revolution (1855-1932); (2) the period of economic nationalism, from 1932 to 1947; (3) the decade of bureaucratic capitalist development (1947-1957); and (4) the industrialization period (1960-1980s). For each period the study poses four key questions, viz.: what kind of industries were dominant, what was the ethnic and socio-political background of the capitalist groups, how did they emerge, and what interaction was there between political power and capitalist groups?

The author definitely had high ambitions when setting out to cover such a long period. In some important respects he has succeeded. The various chapters provide a wealth of data, besides company histories, which definitely contribute to our understanding of the development of the Thai economy since the mid-nineteenth century. The book further describes how the role of foreign enterprises changed from the export of resource-based products and import of modern products in the mid-nineteenth century to the transfer of technology in recent decades. Over the same period local capitalist groups emerged, first from among tax farmers and later from among more recent Chinese immigrants. Most of the capitalist groups were dependent on the government elites, namely first on the traditional bureaucratic class and later, after 1932, on the new civil and military rulers. Suehiro's most important contribution is the extensive documentation of the development since the 1960s of a rapidly growing domestic capitalist group, which, much more than previous capitalist groups in Thailand, is fairly independent of the military, foreign enterprises, and the old and new bureaucracies. Another important recent development is the business community's gradual loss of its distinct Chinese character due to the cultural assimilation of the younger generation and to the entry of ethnic Thai into business. The study is well documented on all of these points and provides valuable information for all categories of researchers. It should draw wide attention from those interested in Thai economic development.

The weak points of the book are its ignorance of relevant general literature on economic development, and its virtual neglect of the effects of domestic and international business cycles, which have exercised so much influence on Thai economic development. As W. Arthur Lewis has shown convincingly in various of his works (Lewis 1970 and 1978), the world trends were favourable in the periods 1870-1913 and 1950-1973, and rather unfavourable in the 1913-1950 period, which was beset by the disruptions of two world wars and major economic crises. For Thailand a number of specific factors played an additional role, such as the opening of the Suez Canal, particular monetary policies, colonial threats, and protective policies in traditional export markets for Thai rice (Sompop 1989).

The weaker parts of the book are those treating economic theory and the theory of development. Exemplary for this is the following comment on the role of the World Bank in the context of the discussion of the 1957

World Bank Mission to Thailand: 'The basic idea of the World Bank was the same as that of the United States, especially the National Economic Committee led by W. W. Rostov, who had formulated the strategy of 'economic development' as a counter-measure against growing communist threats' (p. 179). The fact aside that the statement is almost devoid of meaning, it should be noted that 1957 was three years before the publication of Rostov's book (*The Stages of Economic Growth*). The discussion of stages in economic development (pp. 273-4) is rather poor in view of the extensive literature on that subject.

A serious simplification in the book is Suehiro's claim that the three per cent limit on Thai import duties, which the Bowring Treaty imposed for the period 1855-1926, constituted the main obstacle to industrialization. This misapprehension, which Suehiro shares with several social scientists and historians, can also be attributed to ignorance of relevant general economic literature. There is an extensive literature on the merits and demerits of protectionism as an instrument of industrialization (for a critical overview see Meier 1984:388-94). The crucial factors influencing industrialization are first of all the general economic conditions. Again, Lewis discusses the different opportunities which non-Western countries had for responding to the challenge of the encroaching world economy in the nineteenth century at length. There is a series of conditions which must be satisfied before a country can successfully industrialize, and, as I have argued elsewhere, these conditions were much more favourable in Thailand after the Second World War than before it (Van der Meer 1989). The relatively high wage level in Thailand, which was connected with its abundance of resources and scarcity of labour, the low level of education and technology, and the limited domestic market made Thailand one of the most unlikely countries for industrialization. Against this background it is highly unlikely, in my view, that protection of infant industries could have contributed significantly to industrialization and general economic development in the period before 1926. In recent years various countries have experienced that such policies can have serious negative effects. In retrospect it seems that the best thing that the Thai government could have done, and the goal it should have pursued most vigorously, would have been to expand the infrastructure and to promote education.

A final criticism is that the author sometimes uses language which one would expect rather from a political pamphleteer than from a scholar writing a serious historical study. The way in which terms like 'capitalism', 'monopoly' and 'oligopolist' are used, without a proper definition, is illustrative of this. But apart from points like this, the book is informative and makes pleasant reading.

Publications consulted:

- Lewis, W. A., 1970, *Tropical Development 1880-1913: Studies in Economic Progress*, London: Allen & Unwin.
 —, 1978, *Growth and Fluctuations 1870-1913*, 1978, London: Allen & Unwin.
 Meer, Kees van der, 1989, 'A Comparison of Factors Influencing Economic Development in Thailand and Indonesia, 1820-1940', in: Angus Maddison and Gé Prince, *Economic Growth in Indonesia, 1820-1940*, Dordrecht: Foris.

Meier, G. M., 1984, *Leading Issues in Economic Development*. (Fourth Edition), Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Sompop Manarungsan, 1989, *Economic Development of Thailand, 1850-1950: Response to the Challenge of the World Economy*, Ph.D. Thesis, University of Groningen, The Netherlands. [Published by the author at Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok.]

Nancy Eberhardt (ed.), *Gender, Power, and the Construction of the Moral Order: Studies from the Thai Periphery*, University of Wisconsin-Madison, Center for Southeast Asian Studies, Monograph 4, 1988. viii + 100 pages, soft cover. Library of Congress Card 88-50917.

NIELS MULDER

The editor claims in her introduction that the approach to gender taken in this book is different from that of conventional scholarship. So she questions whether *the* position of women can, in fact, be assessed (p. 5) and proposes 'to explore alternative ways of conceptualizing perceived differences in power and moral authority between women and men'. This is allegedly aimed at 'understanding the processes and strategies by which gender systems themselves are sustained, manipulated, and ultimately changed' (p. 6).

Whereas thinking about gender is part of a given society's moral order, in everyday life the relations between gender, power, and morality are continually being constructed and reconstructed. This dynamic and dialectical principle makes the four essays in this book original and interesting.

The local foci are peripheral to Thai culture, indeed, certainly where the chapters by Jane R. Hanks, 'The Power of Akha Women', Cornelia Ann Kammerer, 'Shifting Gender Asymmetries among Akha of Northern Thailand', and Ann Maxwell Hill, 'Women without Talents are Virtuous' (dealing with recent immigrant Yunnanese), are concerned. These chapters are followed by Nancy Eberhardt's 'Siren Song: Negotiating Gender Images in a Rural Shan Village'. Whereas the Shan, or Thai Yai, culturally are relatives of the Thai, the idea behind the 'Thai Periphery' of the title is that the minority populations of Northern Thailand are being increasingly influenced by the dominant political, administrative, and cultural Thai context in which they have to live.

It is the contact with this wider context, as well as development efforts and ecological deterioration that are providing powerful stimuli to gender dynamics, at least judging from the first three essays. Thinking about gender is challenged by the exceptional personality of a Shan woman singer. Because of the theoretical cohesion between the chapters, the diverse descriptive material is consistent, while driving home the message that cultural studies only make sense if they are undertaken from the dynamic action theoretical perspective required by modern anthropology. This perspective is especially prominent in Eberhardt's 'Introduction' (pp. 1-10) and Kammerer's theoretical reflections (pp. 46-49), which effectively challenge some of the 'conventional wisdom' that often encumbers

less aware anthropological description. Consequently this monograph makes good reading for all who are interested in the study of gender, while also giving some ethnographic information about the lives of people in the Golden Triangle.

Jan Nederveen Pieterse, *Wit over zwart; Beelden van Afrika en zwarten in de Westerse populaire cultuur*. Amsterdam: Koninklijk Instituut voor de Tropen, 1990. 259 pp., ill.

Raymond Corbey, *Wildheid en beschaving; De Europese verbeelding van Afrika*. Baarn: Ambo, 1989. 182 pp., ill.

GERT OOSTINDIE

Het besef dat Westerse beeldvorming van niet-Westerse volken vaak meer zegt over de beeld-vormende cultuur dan over de 'verbeelde' cultuur is, theoretisch althans, niets nieuws. In *Discours sur [...] l'inégalité* stelt Rousseau al over zijn Europese tijdgenoten dat 'Ils parloient de l'homme sauvage et ils peignoient l'homme civil'.¹ In de weerbarstige praktijk van alledag, in het bijzonder in het immigratiegebied West-Europa van de laatste decennia, wijkt dit besef voortdurend voor minder 'verlichte' denkbeelden. Die noemen wij gemakshalve rassendiscriminatie.

Recentelijk verschenen twee Nederlandstalige studies die uitvoerig illustreren hoezeer ook in het verleden de Westeuropese beeldvorming van Afrikanen/zwarten problemen en obsessies van de eigen Westerse wereld reflecteerde. De ideeën van beide auteurs zijn sterk verwant; de boeken dragen echter ieder een geheel eigen karakter.

Wit over zwart werd gepubliceerd naar aanleiding van een gelijknamige tentoonstelling in het Amsterdamse Tropenmuseum (december 1989 - augustus 1990). Het boek is geen catalogus bij het daar gepresenteerde beeldmateriaal, maar bedoelt een studie te zijn van Westerse ('witte') beeldvorming van Afrika en zwarten (in Afrika, de Nieuwe Wereld, Europa) door de eeuwen heen. Als zodanig is het een welkome bijdrage, de eerste in het Nederlandse taalgebied waarin deze thematiek met een zo breed penseel wordt geschilderd.²

Nederveen Pieterse haalt, met grondige kennis van zaken, zeer veel overhoop: chronologisch bestrijkt het boek de periode van 2500 v.C. tot onze tijd, geografisch Afrika, Europa en de Amerika's. Geschreven wordt over beeldende kunst, letterkunde, filosofie en wetenschap, koloniale tentoonstellingen, kinderboeken, de moderne showbusiness, advertenties in de massamedia etc. De auteur beoogt het Eurocentrische en racistische karakter van de witte beeldvorming aan te tonen. Slaagt hij daarin? Enerzijds wel, in de zin dat het gepresenteerde materiaal inderdaad is

¹ Jean-Jacques Rousseau, *Discours sur les origines et les fondements de l'inégalité parmi les hommes* (1755), geciteerd door Corbey, p. 4.

² Zie Ton Lemaire, *De Indiaan in ons bewustzijn; De ontmoeting van de Oude met de Nieuwe Wereld* (Baarn: Ambo, 1986) voor een enigszins vergelijkbare, zij het veel toegankelijker studie van de Westerse verbeelding van de Amerikaanse Indiaan.

doortrokken van wit superioriteitsgevoel. Anderzijds roepen de ambitieuze reikwijdte (chronologisch en geografisch/cultureel) en de belerende toon bij de lezer een gevoel van wrevel op, dat wellicht na lezing van het boek meer blijft hangen dan het beoogde besef van de onredelijkheid en onrechtvaardigheid van de witte beeldvorming. Tijden, culturen en typen van beeldvorming worden voortdurend dooreen gepresenteerd, terwijl bovendien een serieuze discussie van de representativiteit van het besproken beeldmateriaal achterwege blijft. Methodologisch is dit dubieus, de geloofwaardigheid van de analyse wordt door deze 'overkill' van al te stellig geformuleerde conclusies eerder ondergraven dan onderstreept.

Wit over zwart beperkt zich niet tot een bespreking van empirisch beeldmateriaal (dat deels in het boek is afgebeeld). Regelmatig verwijst Nederveen Pieterse daarnaast naar theoretische discussies en ijkpunten van uiteenlopende snit: Freudiaans, (post-)structuralistisch, Foucaultiaans, deconstructivistisch, etc. Die verwijzingen zijn niet altijd even duidelijk en relevant. En ook hier bekruipt de lezer enige wrevel. Zeker, de 'culturele dekolonisering' waarover de auteur spreekt moet nog plaatsvinden en ook *Wit over zwart* levert daartoe een nuttige bijdrage. Maar waar onbevangen analyse wijkt voor mistig en geleend jargon ('Dit onderzoek op het gebied van interculturele beeldvorming is een onvoltooide verkenning van de verhoudingen tussen beeldvorming van "anderen" en het verschijnsel macht en hiërarchie; anders gezegd, een verkenning op het gebied van de "politiek van de representatie".' – p. 224), daar schiet de auteur zijn loffelijk doel voorbij.

Bij een bespreking van *Wildheid en beschaving* mag ik mij niet achter 'de lezer' verschuilen. Vertrekkend vanuit eenzelfde onderzoeksinteresse als Nederveen Pieterse analyseert Corbey de Europese verbeelding van Afrika. Ook hier een rechtlijnig betoog en een niet zelden belerende toon. Terwijl echter *Wit over zwart* een zeer groot veld van beelden bespreekt, beperkt Corbey zich in essentie tot een verzameling ansichtkaarten uit Afrika, bestemd voor de Europese markt en daterend uit de eerste drie decennia van deze eeuw. Corbey heeft hieruit de exotisch geladen portretten van (half-)naakte Afrikaanse vrouwen geselecteerd. Deze selectie, geïnterpreteerd vanuit een theoretisch panopticum gedomineerd door auteurs als Foucault, Derrida en Bourdieu, vormt de basis voor dit boek. Een en ander leidt, behalve tot veel jargon in de sfeer van het 'discours', tot bespiegelingen als: 'De Afrikaanse [vrouw] verschijnt op de koloniale ansichtkaart als een wellustig wezen, Afrika als een erotische droomwereld. Europa staat voor beschaving, beheersing, Afrika voor wildheid, impulsiviteit.' (p.57). Het kan zijn, het kan ook niet zo zijn.

Wildheid en beschaving biedt een hier meer, daar minder geslaagde poging een filosofisch vertoog te presenteren over de Afrikaan(se) als de Ander; gemeten naar 'positivistische' normen van methodologische scherpheid of verifieerbaarheid blijft het boek zeer in gebreke. Al te zeer wat mij betreft.

Zowel *Wit over zwart* als *Wildheid en beschaving* gaan gebukt onder het Grote Gelijk. De conclusie (het racisme ging de Europese denkwereld domineren, respectievelijk doet dit nog steeds) overheerst, de twijfel ontbreekt. Een voorbeeld. Het lijkt mij zeer de vraag of beelden van Afrika

c.q. zwarten in het Europa van 1700, 1800 of 1900 überhaupt meer dan een marginale rol speelden in de denkwereld van de 'gewone man' – of omgekeerd, buiten de beperkte sociale milieus van enkele filosofen, staatslieden en 'Atlantische kapitalisten'. De impliciete aanname dat dit wél het geval was berust op retroprojectie. Het resultaat is de anachronistische constructie van een probleem dat aan analyses wordt onderworpen zonder dat het bestaan ervan deugdelijk is aangetoond.

Deze kritiek neemt niet weg dat beide boeken, zij het niet in gelijke mate, nuttige bijdragen leveren aan een discussie over Westerse verbeelding en racisme. Beide boeken bevatten, naast het gesignaleerde jargon, veel boeiende en goed geschreven passages. Het illustratiemateriaal is mooi en in *Wit over zwart* veelzijdig. Beide boeken besluiten met een onvolledig register.

Inga Clendinnen, *Ambivalent conquests; Maya and Spaniard in Yucatan, 1517-1570*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988. xi + 243 pp.

R. PLOEG

Ambivalent conquests is a praiseworthy achievement. Inga Clendinnen here has managed to correct the one-sided picture of the cruel Spaniards and the submissive Maya Indians. In her analysis of the early contacts between Spaniards and Maya she gives a proper perspective on the position of the Yucatan Peninsula vis-à-vis Central Mexico and Guatemala in the 16th century:

The book juxtaposes the perceptions of the Spanish conquest of this area of both of the parties involved. It appears that there was ambivalence not only between Spaniards and Maya, but also among Spaniards and Maya.

In her descriptions – which are at times rather too detailed – Inga Clendinnen successfully takes the reader into the Yucatan fields and villages of the days of the conquest. This way the impact of the Spanish activities on and their serious consequences for the Maya culture in the economic, political and religious fields become palpably apparent.

Along with the recent ethno-historical studies by Jones, Farris and others, *Ambivalent conquests* forms an important contribution to the (pre-)history of Yucatan in all its facets.

Luigi Santa Maria, Faizah Soenoto Rivai and Antonio Sorrentino (eds), *Papers from the III European Colloquium on Malay and Indonesian Studies*. Istituto Universitario Orientale, Dipartimento di Studi Asiatici (Series Minor XXX). Naples 1988. 276 pp.

S.O. ROBSON

After a long delay, for which the editors apologize, this volume of twenty-one papers from the Third European Colloquium held in Naples on 2-4

June 1981 has appeared. As can be seen from the following Table of Contents, these papers cover a variety of subjects and are in both English and French.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

J.C. Anceaux (Netherlands), <i>Some remarks on the literature of Buton</i>	1
M. Baistrocchi (Italy), <i>Wood-carving of the Malay aborigines</i>	5
A. Bausani (Italy), <i>The contribution of Nicolò de Conti (1395-1469) to the knowledge of Indonesia</i>	15
M. Blussé Boin (France), <i>The Kai Ba Lidai Shiji chronicle of the Chinese community in Batavia</i>	29
G. Corradi et E. Giordana (Italy), <i>Tutrean: un village des îles Kai. Un exemple d'interventions extérieures et résistances culturelles dans une région de l'Indonésie Orientale</i>	43
J.G. de Casparis (Netherlands), <i>Some notes on words of Middle Indian origin in Indonesian languages (especially Old Javanese)</i>	51
G.W.J. Drewes (Netherlands), <i>Recent developments in Indonesian studies in the Netherlands</i>	71
Muhammad Haji Salleh (Malaysia), <i>Recent Malaysian research in Malay studies</i>	81
G. Hamonic (France), <i>La fête du grand Maulud à Cikoang. Traces d'influence chi'ite en Pays Makassar?</i>	95
Nafron Hasjim (Indonesia), <i>Syair Abdul Muluk dalam pementasan - sebuah informasi</i>	107
H.I.R. Hinzler (Leiden), <i>On Balinese name-giving rituals</i>	121
H. Jacobs S.J. (Netherlands), <i>A forgotten mission: works of the Jesuits in the Maluku Archipelago (1546-1677)</i>	147
R. Jones (G. Britain), <i>From papermill to scribe: the lapse of time</i>	153
D. Lombard (France), <i>Recherches d'histoire urbaine: le cas de Surabaya</i>	171
C. Pelras (France), <i>Le trésor des contes Bugis</i>	181
N. Phillips (G. Britain), <i>Further thought on the metre of Sijobang</i>	195
Z.A. Salazar (Philippines), <i>Pour un domaine Philippino-Est-Indonésien de recherche</i>	215
G. Soravia (Italy), <i>A preliminary report on the Gajo texts collected by Ch. Snouck Hurgronje and G.A.J. Hazeu in Leiden University Library</i>	227
A. Sorrentino (Italy), <i>Considérations sur des mots d'origine malaise en tamoul</i>	243
Luis Filipe F.R. Thomaz (Portugal), <i>L'influence du malais sur le vocabulaire portugais</i>	251
M. Zaini-Lajoubert (France), <i>Quelques notes sur une oeuvre didactique malaise du XIX siècle</i>	267

J.M.R. Schrils, *Een democratie in gevaar: Een verslag van de situatie op Curaçao tot 1987*. Van Gorcum, Assen: 1990. ISBN 90 232 2527 9. xii + 292 blz.

R.A. RÖMER

Rijksuniversiteit Groningen

Het primaire doel dat de schrijver van deze studie voor ogen stond, was een verklaring en een beschrijving te geven van de politieke cultuur op het eiland Curaçao, het grootste eiland van de Nederlandse Antillen. Daarnaast heeft hij een 'soort inventarisatie' willen maken van 'al die factoren die [onze] democratie negatief beïnvloed hebben of negatief kunnen beïnvloeden', om tenslotte te 'trachten enige aanwijzingen te geven voor de aanpak van de [door mij] geconstateerde problemen'.

Met deze doelstellingen is ook meteen de zwakte van deze studie aangegeven: Schrils had zich beter tot een beschrijving van de politieke cultuur kunnen beperken en de poging tot 'verklaring' achterwege kunnen laten. Dan had hij ook niet behoeven te streven naar een inventarisatie van 'al die factoren' die de democratie op het eiland negatief beïnvloeden. Dit streven naar volledigheid gericht op de verklaring van de politieke cultuur is de kwaliteit van het boek niet ten goede gekomen. Hij heeft voor zijn 'verklaring' gemeend zoveel factoren te moeten aandragen dat hij te weinig selectief is geweest. Zelf zegt hij hierover in zijn 'Aanbevelingen' aan het einde van zijn boek (p. 219) dat in het boek 'tal van ideeën naar voren zijn gebracht die wetenschappelijk beter onderzocht hadden moeten worden' en dat 'het daarom best mogelijk [is] dat sommige ideeën en beschrijvingen niet volledig met de realiteit kloppen'. Dat is jammer, want de schrijver heeft ontzettend veel literatuur geraadpleegd en verschaft een massa aan gegevens. Een juiste evaluatie van dit aanbod aan gegevens vereist echter een selectieve benadering die een zekere kennis van de Antilliaanse c.q. Curaçaose situatie veronderstelt.

Met een bewonderenswaardige ijver stort de schrijver zich op de vele misstanden die het functioneren van de democratie bedreigen en komt dan tot de welhaast apocalyptische conclusie 'door het grotendeels ontbreken van de nodige voorwaarden voor een democratie [etc.] moeten wij ons [echter] ernstige zorgen maken om het voortbestaan van de samenleving' (p. 217).

Nogmaals, ik betreur deze benadering, vooral omdat het boek een goede beschrijving geeft van de politieke geschiedenis en de politieke cultuur van de samenleving waar de studie over gaat en vele elementen signaleert die daar deel van uitmaken. Had hij zich daartoe beperkt dan had hij heel valide conclusies kunnen aandragen ter onderbouwing van zijn belangrijkste stelling, n.l. dat de democratie op Curaçao gebrekkig functioneert. Of de democratie daarmee ook in gevaar verkeert, is een andere zaak.

Han ten Brummelhuis, *Merchant, courtier and diplomat: A history of the contacts between the Netherlands and Thailand*, Lochem, 1987, 116 pp., illustrated.

PATRICIA D. RUEB

The Dutch government arranged for this study to be made in honour of the sixtieth birthday of the King of Thailand. Its official aim was to commemorate some 380 years of almost uninterrupted relations between the Netherlands and Thailand (called Siam until the Second World War).

The study is divided into two parts, the first entitled 'The East India Company period' (covering the 17th and 18th centuries) and the second 'The modern era'. Ten Brummelhuis has chosen to reconstruct the past primarily by following the reports of VOC employees. As a result, Siamese-Dutch relations come clearly into focus, while the surrounding regions remain more or less hazy and obscure. Since most Western readers are bound to know little about the political history of this Southeast Asian kingdom, they may have some difficulty in placing the events in their proper perspective.

This work makes pleasant reading, however, as well as providing many fascinating details about both the past and present. We learn, for instance, that in 1765 the Burmese soldiers quietly sowed the rice fields on the eve of the final assault on the Siamese capital, Ayutthaya. This is particularly informative about the methods of early warfare. Furthermore, who would have imagined that the Siamese envoy to Paris in the 1930s had been educated in Rolduc?

Dutch-Siamese relations were definitely of a commercial nature, and one should not be unduly impressed by the title of the book. It certainly is no tale of aristocrats and multifarious Dutch exploits at the Siamese court over many centuries. Trickery and deceit, heavy drinking and promiscuity were the common elements of life in the stockaded and moated Company warehouses. Admittedly, some Dutchmen attained high ranks, which effectively gave them access to the centre of political power, the court. In the social hierarchy of the Indianized kingdoms, traders had a very low status. The upgrading of a merchant, backed by a powerful trading company, was therefore a prerequisite for partnership. Dutch military aid was often requested and always politely refused. The privilege of being a courtier was a question of mutual commitment, but on an unequal footing, for the smell of the warehouse lingered on. Some Dutch merchants, as well as their successors, the nineteenth-century consuls, adjusted to Siamese conditions and did well in business. However, once they had gone native, they lost their usefulness to their superiors and were discarded. The Dutch did not appoint career diplomats until 1903.

Aside from forest products and foodstuff – wood, rice and deerskins – the Siamese export trade passing through Dutch hands was of marginal importance in the long run. It would remain so until some fifteen years ago when the export of Thai tapioca marked the beginning of a new phase. Between 1608 and 1765 Dutch trading faced strong competition from the cosmopolitan population of Ayutthaya, Asians and Europeans alike. The king and his court, moreover, were extremely jealous of their prerogatives,

and the royal monopolies on certain import and export products (textiles, gold, benzoin and tin) were rigorously enforced. The author attaches great importance to the treaty of 1664, whereby the Dutch supposedly obtained extraterritorial powers. A clause to this effect was, however, part and parcel of most of the innumerable contracts concluded between the VOC and its Asian counterparts. Sometimes these contracts were implemented, but more often they were not. In the case of Siam, Dutch judicial rights and extraterritorial powers were either ignored or disputed over the centuries. The quest for undisturbed consular jurisdiction was finally abandoned some eighty years ago.

The Dutch import trade in Siam was structurally limited because of the self-sufficiency of this country's agrarian economy. Silver, luxury goods and services – such as shipping and the transfer of technical know-how – , on the other hand, were in high demand. Technical skills were eagerly sought-after. The keen interest shown by King Culalongkorn (1873-1910) in technology is proof yet again of the receptive spirit of the Thais. Around the turn of the century Dutch hydraulic engineers were invited to design and implement an impressive irrigation scheme. But they failed to satisfy the Siamese specifications, partly because of their uncompromising attitude towards modernization.

However cordial Thai-Dutch relations may be today, the iconographic tradition casts a dark shadow on this blissful picture. Where Ten Brummelhuis notes the presence of the Dutch on old Thai murals, he is probably not aware that these people are depicted in the midst of the army of Mara – temptress of Buddha and evil demon of death!
